From: Tom Hoffay <thoffay160@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, January 13, 2022 1:32 PM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Okay, let's try again...

My statement - to be included in tonight's Public Hearing on the Kingstonian's request for a partial closure of Fair St. Extension (1 block).

January 12,2022

Dear President Shaut and members of the Common Council,

Good evening. As a senior citizen in the Kingston community, in light of the Covid pandemic, although I was looking forward to attending tonight's Public Hearing on the Kingstonian application for the partial closing of Fair St., I chose to submit a written statement instead for your consideration.

I am a strong supporter of the Kingstonian Project for the Uptown, Stockade District in our city, I represented the district, part of the Second Ward, for three terms on the Common Council. I have served on the Board of KUBA (Kingston Uptown Business Association) and the Friends of Historic Kingston. I mention these only to establish that I am familiar with the very unique history, circumstances and controversies of the area, now the subject of great scrutiny.

I was Alderman for the Second Ward when the parking garage was demolished after it was found to have structural issues, speaking of controversies - and when the city adopted the NYS DOT plan for the recently completed roundabout. The Pike Plan renovations, inherited from my predecessor, are worthy of a book!

To sustain the new vitality of what is admittedly a rather compressed area, it is necessary to embrace infrastructure challenges, not dismiss them out of hand. Kingston has an opportunity to make a sustained improvement to the quality of living, working and visiting this historic gem. The KIngstonian project is a defining moment for the city - will it move forward or risk stagnation? Rejecting components of the plan such as the Fair St. extension modification, might very well end that opportunity. It would certainly discourage any attempts at future development and leave a gaping hole in the streetscape.

An additional comment is warranted concerning the recent attack on the integrity of the Kingston Fire Department. While on the Common Council I served as liaison to the Fire Commission, and presently serve as one of the Commissioners. Like many other residents of this city I was stunned to see full page ads in the Daily Freeman and on social media declaring that fire protection would suffer if the Fair St extension were to close. No attempt was made by the author of this scurrilous attack to contact the department, the only consultant was a paid hack of William Gottlieb Real Estate.

The Kingston Fire Department is highly regarded in New York State, providing emergency medical as well as fire service. Buildings are subject to inspection and new buildings are offered design consultation. To imply that KFD would somehow endanger the health and safety of residents - as a way to attack the Kingstonian project is truly contemptible. No contact was made with the Chief of the Department, no input was requested before this tactic by opponents was used. How egregious it is to compromise the work of the men and women who serve as emergency responders under such hazardous circumstances. With the Frog Alley Station just one long block away from Fair St. Extension, the accusation in the full paid ad is false and intended to prey upon concerns of the community.

Enough has been said about the Kingstonian Project - it has passed through many reviews and survived lawsuits by the representatives of the same real estate organization. It's time to let the project proceed to completion. Please support the legislation for the closing of Fair St. extension.

Respectfully.

Tom Hoffay

From:

Kathleen Kearney < kidget21@hotmail.com>

Sent:

Thursday, January 13, 2022 9:32 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] Kingstonian

Follow Up Flag:

Follow up

Flag Status:

Flagged

I am in complete support of the Kingstonian. It's time this city moves forward and provides jobs, housing and economy for the area.

Thank you.

Sent from my iPhone

ā		





December 2, 2021

Re: Traffic Peer Review

Kingstonian – Fair Street Extension Closure 9-21 North Front Street, Kingston, NY Langan Project No.: 190074001

Attached please find our memorandum (dated: December 2, 2021) prepared at the request of Rodenhausen Chale & Polidoro LLP. This memorandum summarizes the peer review of a Traffic Impact Study (TIS) prepared for a mixed-use urban development located on Fair Street Extension between North Front Street and Schwenk Drive in Kingston, NY.

Sincerely,

Langan Engineering, Environmental, Surveying, Landscape Architecture and Geology, D.P.C.

Adnan Pasha, PE

Associate / Director of Transportation

(NY & Langan International)

Brian Weinboy

Brian Weinberg, PE

Senior Project Manager

Enclosure(s): Traffic Peer Review Memorandum

cc: Michael Burke, Langan



Memorandum

Langan Engineering, Environmental, Surveying, Landscape Architecture and Geology, D.P.C.

21 Penn Plaza, 360 West 31st Street, 8th Floor New York, NY 10001 T: 212.479.5400 F: 212.479.5444

To:

Victoria L. Polidoro, Esg. - Rodenhausen Chale & Polidoro LLP

From:

Adnan Pasha, PE and Brian Weinberg, PE

Date:

November 2, 2021 (First Submission)

December 2, 2021 (Revised)

Re:

Traffic Peer Review

Kingstonian – Fair Street Extension Closure 9-21 North Front Street, Kingston, NY

Langan Project No.: 190074001

Introduction

At the request of Rodenhausen Chale & Polidoro LLP, Langan conducted a peer review of a Traffic Impact Study (TIS) prepared for a mixed-use urban development located on Fair Street Extension between North Front Street and Schwenk Drive in Kingston, NY.

As part of this project, the existing Fair Street Extension roadway segment will be closed to through traffic. This would allow its northern section to be used as a proposed site driveway to/from Schwenk Drive while the southern section of the closed street would become a pedestrian plaza.

Project Background

The TIS for the proposed project was prepared by Creighton Manning Engineers (CME) in July 2019. The TIS was submitted to the City of Kingston Planning Board, which concluded that: "The closure of Fair Street Extension to through traffic as part of the Kingstonian project is not expected to have an adverse impact on the operation of adjacent intersections based on CME's capacity analysis contained herein." Furthermore, HVEA Engineers, working for the City of Kingston Planning Board, reviewed the TIS and stated the following in a letter (dated: 7 October 2019): "The closure of Fair Street Extension is a critical component of the proposed development. It has been adequately demonstrated that this action shall have no significant adverse impact on the adjacent roadway network."

Consequently, the City of Kingston Planning Board issued a SEQR Type 1 Action Negative Declaration and Determination of Environmental Non-Significance for the project on 16 December 2019.

Peer Review Summary and Findings

The following summarizes our peer review of the traffic assessment and potential adverse traffic impacts related to the closure of Fair Street Extension presented in the TIS.

Traffic Peer Review Kingstonian – Fair Street Extension Closure 9-21 North Front Street, Kingston, NY Langan Project No.: 190074001 December 2, 2021 (Revised) - Page 2 of 5

Peak Hour Analysis

The TIS conducted traffic counts and intersection capacity analysis for only the weekday evening peak period. Specifically, the TIS states: "This traffic study focuses on the weekday PM peak period, which corresponds to peak operations at the proposed site and peak traffic conditions on the surrounding roadway network." However, the statement that the PM peak period reflects the peak traffic conditions on the surrounding roadway network is not substantiated in the TIS. It should be noted that the *Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Trip Generation Manual*, which was used in the TIS to estimate the PM peak period project-generated traffic volumes, also identifies the weekday morning as a typical peak period for traffic activity for residential and hotel land uses. Therefore, the TIS should have estimated the trips generated by the proposed development in the weekday morning peak hour to determine if additional peak hour analysis was warranted.

Traffic Reassignments

The proposed project would result in the reassignment of traffic due to the closure of Fair Street Extension. The basis and methodology for traffic volume reassignments are not explicitly detailed in the TIS and it only makes a reference by stating: "The observed 36 vehicles utilizing the [municipal parking lot] driveway on Fair Street Extension as well as through traffic on Fair Street Extension were conservatively redistributed within the roadway network." To get a better understanding of the detailed traffic reassignments, we subtracted the project-generated trips and 2025 No-Build volumes from the 2025 Build volumes presented in the TIS. Based on this exercise, we identified the following traffic reassignments:

- 1. For the traffic on southbound Fair Street Extension approaching from Kings Plaza Driveway, nearly half was assigned along eastbound Schwenk Drive to southbound Clinton Avenue and nearly half was assigned along westbound Schwenk Drive to southbound Frog Alley to southbound Green Street.
- 2. For the traffic on southbound Fair Street Extension approaching from eastbound Schwenk Drive, all was assigned along southbound Frog Alley to southbound Green Street.
- 3. For the traffic on northbound Fair Street Extension from North Front Street, nearly half was assigned along northbound Clinton Avenue to westbound Schwenk Drive to the Kingston Plaza Driveway and nearly half was assigned along northbound Frog Alley to Schwenk Drive.

Based on the above, the reassignments would increase the traffic levels on critical lane groups at the intersection of Schwenk Drive and Frog Alley. Specifically, the reassignments would result in an additional 44 vehicles using the westbound left-turn pocket lane on Schwenk Drive. This pocket lane is approximately 70 feet long and would not be able to provide the appropriate queuing length for more than three vehicles at a given time. The lack of queuing space would



Traffic Peer Review
Kingstonian – Fair Street Extension Closure
9-21 North Front Street, Kingston, NY
Langan Project No.: 190074001
December 2, 2021 (Revised) - Page 3 of 5

result in vehicular spillback, which could introduce notable delays and potentially adversely impact the through traffic circulation and operations on westbound Schwenk Drive.

Traffic Study Area

The TIS analyzed a traffic study area consisting of 10 intersections. Given the magnitude of traffic reassignments, additional intersections should have been included in the study area. Specifically, the intersections along the following roadway segments should have been analyzed in the TIS to assess the potential impact of reassigned traffic volumes on traffic operations:

Green Street Corridor

Approximately 98 vehicles were reassigned southbound along Green Street. The intersections of Green Street with Lucas Avenue, Crown Street, and Main Street should have been included in the traffic study area.

John Street Corridor

Approximately 45 vehicles were reassigned eastbound along John Street approaching Clinton Avenue. The intersections of John Street with Wall Street and Fair Street should have been included in the traffic study area.

Clinton Street Corridor

Approximately 36 vehicles were reassigned southbound along Clinton Street south of Main Street. The intersection of Clinton Street/Albany Street/Pearl Street should have been included in the traffic study area.

Kingston Fire Station 2 - Wiltwyck Station

Based on the reassignments, approximately 159 two-way north/south additional trips would use Frog Alley between Schwenk Drive and North Front Street. These additional reassigned traffic volumes would have the potential to affect the Kingston Fire Station 2 – Wiltwyck Station, which is also located on this block. The TIS should have analyzed the traffic conditions on Frog Alley, during the morning and evening peak hours, to assess the potential impact of the reassigned traffic volumes on the fire station operations. Specifically, the reassigned traffic could potentially increase congestion leading to longer emergency vehicle response times and could result in longer vehicular queues during the times of fire truck maneuvering. A standalone study is being performed to quantify the impact of the reassignment on response time by Kingston Fire Station 2. The findings of the study will be presented under separate cover and, if they impact the conclusions presented in this memo, an updated memo will be prepared.

Traffic Peer Review
Kingstonian – Fair Street Extension Closure
9-21 North Front Street, Kingston, NY
Langan Project No.: 190074001
December 2, 2021 (Revised) - Page 4 of 5

Southbound Fair Street Reassignments

The reassigned traffic volumes on Frog Alley continued southbound through Green Street to leave the study area. A conservative approach would have reassigned the traffic from Frog Alley to turn onto eastbound North Front Street to continue to southbound Fair Street. This would have been a conservative analysis in terms of pedestrian safety as North Front Street is a pedestrian-oriented retail corridor which could get adversely impacted by additional traffic volumes. Lack of traffic reassignments on North Front Street negates the assertion that the TIS did a conservative reassignment of traffic volumes.

Pedestrian Circulation and ADA/HRL Access During Construction

The Fair Street Extension will be closed to pedestrian traffic during the construction of the project. To our knowledge, temporary accommodations for Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) and New York State Human Rights Law (HRL) pedestrian access between Schwenk Drive and North Front Street have not been proposed during the construction phase.

In the absence of ADA/HRL accommodations and pedestrian access, patrons will have to take a detour to travel between Schwenk Drive and North Front Street. This would result in significantly longer walk trips and may result in potential delays due to additional intersection crossing locations; thereby, adversely impacting pedestrian safety and access/egress for neighboring businesses, residences, and community facilities. As such, the detour pedestrian routes could include a connection through either Schwenk Drive, Clinton Avenue, and North Front Street or through Schwenk Drive, Frog Alley, and North Front Street. These detour routes would be approximately 800 to 2100 feet longer than the existing 400-foot long pedestrian connection via Fair Street Extension. Furthermore, these detour routes have constraints including sidewalk on only one side of the street, unprotected pedestrian crossings, uneven sidewalk surfaces, and occasional pinch-points, which would particularly affect the mobility of individuals with physical disabilities, making it harder for them to circulate the area. Furthermore, there are locations along the detour routes where a combination of constraints, such as an uneven sidewalk surface at a pinch-point, which could potentially make a sidewalk unpassable for a wheelchair user, forcing them either into the street or onto adjacent grass or dirt surfaces.

Traffic Count Surveys

On Thursday, October 28, 2021, we conducted Turning Movement Counts (TMCs) at four key intersections in the study area during the weekday AM and PM rush hours. Specifically, data was collected at the following study area intersections:

- Schwenk Drive and Fair Street Extension
- 2. North Front Street and Fair Street Extension
- 3. North Front Street and Wall Street



Traffic Peer Review
Kingstonian – Fair Street Extension Closure
9-21 North Front Street, Kingston, NY
Langan Project No.: 190074001
December 2, 2021 (Revised) - Page 5 of 5

4. North Front Street and Frog Alley

Note that volumes at a fifth study area intersection, Schwenk Drive and Clinton Avenue, were able to be derived based on the volumes counted at adjacent intersections.

Based on a comparison of the PM peak hour traffic volumes at these five intersections from the TMCs to the 2019 Existing Conditions PM peak hour traffic volumes shown in the TIS, traffic levels today are similar to or lower than those in 2019. Therefore, the current PM peak hour traffic conditions would be expected to be similar to 2019. A standalone study is recommended to assess the impact of the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic on lower traffic counts relative to the 2019 study.

In addition to the TMCs, Automatic Traffic Recorders (ATRs) were used to obtain 24-hour, two-way traffic volumes along Fair Street Extension. The 24-hour profile of traffic volumes shows low levels of traffic overnight and in the early morning and then rising volumes through midmorning to a local peak of approximately 191 hourly vehicles around noon. The volumes hold steady through the mid-afternoon, and then rise to an overall peak of approximately 222 vehicles between 4:30 PM and 5:30 PM. The volumes start decreasing notably about an hour later and continue dropping throughout the evening and into the night. Based on this profile, the highest traffic volumes of the day are experienced in the PM peak period.

City of Kingston I-587/Albany/Broadway Intersection Study Conceptual Design Report and Resolution of Support

We have reviewed the City of Kingston I-587/Albany/Broadway Intersection Study Conceptual Design Report (dated: February 2011). On pages 19 and 20 of this Design Report, Fair Street Extension is identified as part of an "expanded network concept" to help solve capacity constraints along Albany and Clinton Avenues, by making a series of new road connections to provide alternate access to destinations uptown. Fair Street Extension is also identified as one of the primary streets in a "Phase 1" of potential improvements to relieve some traffic demand on Albany Avenue and Clinton Avenue, and to improve access to Kingston Plaza. It also identified installing a roundabout as a proposed improvement measure at the intersection of Clinton Avenue, Fair Street Extension, and Schwenk Drive.

We have also reviewed the *Resolution of Support* (dated: May 2, 2012) for the I-587/Albany/Broadway Intersection Study Conceptual Design Report. In the resolution, the City of Kingston expressed support for the Conceptual Design Report's recommendations. Furthermore, the City of Kingston stated that they would form an I-587 Implementation Committee to work with NYSDOT during the design process.

If Fair Street Extension were to close, based on the I-587/Albany/Broadway Intersection Study Conceptual Design Report, fewer alternate routes would be available to relieve traffic demand on Albany Avenue and Clinton Avenue within the expanded network concept.

From: Joe Mangrum <joemangrum@joemangrum.com>

Sent: Thursday, January 13, 2022 2:53 PM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Public Comment: Abandonment of Fair Street Ext.

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

Please make this part of the public hearing records.

My Name is Joe Mangrum and I am a Homeowner in Kingston. I would like to oppose the abandonment of Fair Street extension and the current proposed Kingstonian project for the following reasons.

In my experience as a public artist, the trend for private entities to manage public space is historically problematic. The public commons is essential to our rights of free speech and exercise thereof. The proposed plan both eliminates the small public park and the entire Fair St extension, taking away public space and converting it to private management. My experience when these types of spaces are privatized the space also become regulated by private interests, essentially leading to selective enforcement and erosion of constitutional rights of underserved community of homeless, financially challenged or anyone who utilizes public space for whatever purpose.

For example:

The current proposal creates a grand staircase immediately eliminating bicycle accessibility, forcing cyclists onto Schwenck Dr as the only alternative thoroughfare without completely going out of ones way to Frog Alley to cycle through to and from Kings plaza. The newly constructed pedestrian "mall" provides an illusion of an expansion of the public space but will also be managed by private security in order to provide "Security" for the "interests" of the Luxury apartment residents as opposed to the well being and rights of the general public. I have witnessed time an time again the harassment of homeless for "loitering" or other "crimes" for merely existing in these type of privately managed public spaces.

In NYC the elimination of artists/musicians and buskers have been all but banned in certain public parks managed by Conservancies and private Business improvement districts, disenfranchising a population that simply wants to express their 1st amendment rights in the public commons.

Personally, I have made temporary artworks in the public park at the intersection of Fair and Front St. This plan eliminates a public park, a vital breathing space without retail, that also has some of the only significant foot traffic in all of Kingston and then provides a privately managed space, designed for other purposes. In my opinion, this is a slippery slope that chases the shiny object, yet has absolute downsides that are mostly invisible to a privileged class.

In addition to the elimination of public commons, I oppose the project based on the aesthetic and placement of a parking garage entrance on Front street. This is adding the requirement for every vehicle to then use front street to enter garage that already gets backed up with any delivery vehicle or double parked car. Why is there not a garage entrance off the 3 lane wide section of Schwenk Dr. instead? Funneling traffic to a two way/two lane street makes absolutely no sense, not to mention the ugliness of a garage entrance on a historic street and the fact that cars will be continually backed up and attempting to turn into the garage across the covered walkways in the Front St retail district??? The addition of so many apartment units and there reliance of delivered goods in a covid pandemic couple with a cultural shift to online shopping will only exacerbate the situation, making driving on Front St. nightmarish. I oppose the entrance of this parking garage being on Front St as well as the overall aesthetic of the garage /apartment

structure being out of touch with the visual aesthetics of Front St. While I feel the hotel's design is much more historically sensitive, the extension of the hotel on the back and the entire other garage and apartment structure are very much modern style architecture place in the context of one of the most historically significant districts in the entire country. We owe it to ourselves and the country to not pollute this space with a modern monstrosity that looks like a corporate office building. We should respect our history and build appropriately to reflect some style, not corporate efficiency.

Lastly, I feel the public meeting that was to be held last night at the school was somehow cut short after a planned timing of speakers to adhere to Covid protocols is outrageous. If speakers were scheduled til midnight then the meeting should continue until those speakers are able to speak. The last meeting online was also a farce. I hope this trend in local politics to skirt important input from the public is resolved fairly.

Watching and waiting with concern,

Joe Mangrum Kingston Homeowner

From:

Jackie Ryan <jryan4@hvc.rr.com>

Sent:

Thursday, January 13, 2022 2:54 PM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] Kingston lan

Follow Up Flag:

Follow up

Flag Status:

Flagged

I have lived in Kingston most of my life and am in full support of the kingstonian project. Please move this forward and help Kingston prosper.

Thank you,

Jacqueline Ryan

Sent from my iPhone

From: dennidemos@gmail.com

Sent: Thursday, January 13, 2022 3:04 PM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] THE KINGSTONIAN PROJECT

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

To whome it may concern,

I was at the meeting Wed night and was slated to speak but I was on to late and unfortunately I had to leave ,I am writing instead I am 10000% for the project ,I own Chops Grille and I can't tell you how many nights a week uptown is a ghost town! No traffic no people nothing , thank god we get a few tourist on the weekend to keep us going , this project will bring LIFE back to uptown Kingston , it's a win win win for everyone ,it will bring new people and locals who will sell there house this opening up space for more people ,The Jordan family are a local family who take care of there property , I was in the plaza today. I COULD NOT FIND 1 POT HOLE IN THAT VERY BIG PARKING LOT.!! Not 1. The city should talk to them and ask how they do it. Cause the city roads are full of pot holes , moving on this project is good for everyone , half of WALL ST has empty stores owned by a out of town billionaire that has done nothing with them! The city should get after him. TAX HIM! And let this very much needed project go though.

Thank you

Denni Demosthenes

From:

hadassah ben-dor <gargoylesltd@yahoo.com>

Sent:

Thursday, January 13, 2022 3:21 PM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] support

Follow Up Flag:

Follow up

Flag Status:

Flagged

I support the Kingstonian project. It will be a great addition to the neighborhood,

Hadassah Ben-Dor Gargoyles Ltd 330 Wall St Kingston NY

	0	

From: Joseph Deegan <joseph.deegan@svn.com>

Sent: Thursday, January 13, 2022 3:32 PM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Kingstonian

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

Elisa,

I am just following up regarding my speaking at the public hearing last evening.

Please know that I appreciate the Common Council's involvement and review of this project and in particular the transfer of Fair Street Extension to the developers of the Kingstonian.

As stated, this project provides much needed parking in uptown Kingston that has been lacking for a decade plus. Additionally, this project provides new vibrant badly needed housing.

I cannot emphasize enough my support of the project and it's importance to the City of Kingston.

Thank you again. JD

From: Jeffrey Milstein <paperhous@aol.com> Sent:

Thursday, January 13, 2022 6:58 PM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Kingstonian

Follow Up Flag: Follow up **Flag Status:** Flagged

To whom it may concern:

As owner of 331 Wall Street, Kingston I support the Kingston project.

Best, Jeffrey

Jeffrey Milstein Photography

331 Wall Street

Kingston NY, 12401 Cell: 845 264 9600

jeffreymilstein.com @jeffreymilstein

From:

Dylan Serfis <dylan@macfitness.net>

Sent:

Thursday, January 13, 2022 7:39 PM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] Kingstonian Project

Follow Up Flag: Flag Status:

Follow up Flagged

Dear Kingston Common Council Member,

I am writing in favor of the Council voting to partially close Fair Street Extension. I believe the multitude of public benefits the Kingstonian project brings speaks for itself and clearly warrants this decision.

I thank you for your continued support of this vital economic initiative.

Thank you for your service,

Dylan Serfis

Customer Service/Sales MAC Fitness 338 Plaza Rd. Kingston, NY 12401 P: 845-853-7377

macfitness.net



rā,

From: WILLIAM CLOONAN
bcloo@prodigy.net>

Sent: Thursday, January 13, 2022 7:46 PM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Fwd: THE KINGSTONIAN/ Common Council.

See below.

Sent from my iPad

Begin forwarded message:

From: <bcloo@prodigy.net>

Subject: THE KINGSTONIAN/ Common Council.

I am writing regarding the issue of Fair St Extension and the Kingstonian project. I was unable to be present at the meeting last night due to Covid concerns. I submit my position for consideration to the Common Council.

I have lived here for over 45 years and the present Kingstonian project is a huge positive step in making Kingston a city with a plan for the future.

The Fair street extension "safety issues" are simply an opinion of a person who does not reside in the city and who has been paid for his opinion by another person who also does not live here.

A look back at the roadway will show that up until the early sixties the road existed

as an access road from North Front St. to Montgomery Wards parking lot and the plumbing supply store on the other side of the access roadway. Not until the Kingston Plaza was built did Fair St extension become a through street. There is no historical significance to this road. The uptown area has a desperate need for parking. The cost of a new parking garage is not a part of the city's budget. The value of much needed public parking for Uptown is significant compensation for the street. The Fair St extension area will still be property utilized by the public and better yet maintained by the developer.

Finally the Common Council needs to recognize that most of the financial investment in the opposition to this matter comes from OUTSIDE the community.

I have lived here for over four decades. I have raised a family here and hope for good things to happen in my hometown. This is one of them. Your failure to properly analyze all the issues and vote responsibly will leave a hole in the ground that has been here for over 15 years, adding nothing to the city or to the residents.

This is the opportunity for Kingston to move into the 21st century. I ask that you support the Kingstonian and allow the developer to utilize the Fair St Extension property.

Thank you for your attention. Kathleen Cloonan

Sent from my iPad

From: Eldeva Tofte <eldevat@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 13, 2022 9:14 PM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Cc: Noble, Steve; info@kingstonianny.net

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] | Support the Partial Road Closure of Fair Street Extension

City of Kingston Common Council c/o Elisa Tinti, City Clerk 420 Broadway Kingston, NY 12401

Email: emtinti@kingston-ny.gov

Phone: (845) 334-3915

Dear Kingston Common Council Member,

I am writing in favor of the Council voting to partially close Fair Street Extension. I believe the multitude of public benefits the Kingstonian project brings speaks for itself and clearly warrants this decision.

I thank you for your continued support of this vital economic initiative.

Thank you for your service,

Eldeva Tofte

From: Sent: Holly Snow <holly@macfitness.net> Friday, January 14, 2022 7:33 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] The Kingstonian - We Support the Project

- Uptown Kingston desperately needs public parking. In order to provide a first class parking garage at NO cost to taxpayers, local business leaders came together to offer to build a public parking garage as part of a hotel/apartment/retail project. In addition to 277 public parking spots, the Kingstonian will also provide more tax revenue, affordable housing, public restrooms, new housing stock, over 300 new daily consumers to the uptown district, construction jobs, increased sales tax, tourism and ADA compliant pedestrian access to the business district. In order to make this project a success, it is necessary to partially close a portion of Fair Street Extension. Once closed, developers will construct, for use by the general public:
 - A plaza which will contain a kiosk promoting historic sites in and around Kingston and the Hudson Valley.
 - Storefronts inside the pedestrian plaza creating sales tax and employment.
 - An ADA compliant pedestrian bridge to link the uptown business district to Kingston Plaza and additional parking.
- The pedestrian plaza and ADA compliant bridge are part of the DRI grant and specifically included in how the DRI funds must be used.
- The bridge encourages walkability and pedestrian safety two important items the project was specially asked to provide.
- •As presented from the onset, the linking of both sides of the street is what makes the project most beneficial to the community and economically feasible to build. It allows the project to meet multiple goals outlined in advance by the City of Kingston and so much more—public parking, housing, employment, walkability, pedestrian safety, public restrooms, affordable housing, and public gathering space.

Holly Snow

Owner/Operator MAC Fitness 338 Plaza Rd. Kingston, NY 12401 P: 845-853-7377



From:

Carl Frankel <carlfrankel@gmail.com>

Sent:

Friday, January 14, 2022 7:35 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] Fwd: Fair Street Extension Public Comment for the record

Please include in the record.

Carl Frankel

O: 845-340-1800 *C:* 845-750-7056

In order to die of pleasure, you have to head into delight.

----- Forwarded message ------

From: Rebecca Martin < rebbytunes@gmail.com>

Date: Fri, Jan 14, 2022 at 1:19 AM

Subject: Fwd: Fair Street Extension Public Comment for the record

To: Carl Frankel < carlfrankel@gmail.com>

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Rebecca Martin < rebbytunes@gmail.com>

Date: Fri, Jan 14, 2022 at 12:52 AM

Subject: Fair Street Extension Public Comment for the record

To: <emtinti@kingston-ny.gov>

When the Kingstonian environmental assessment form (EAF) was submitted to the Kingston planning board in early 2019 to begin the project's environmental review process, the council was listed as having two important decisions to make pertaining to the "sale or lease of land" and "closing of Fair Street Extension".

B. Government Approvals

Government Entity	If Yes: Identify Agency and Approval(s) Required	Application Date (Actual or projected)
 a. City Council, Town Board,	Sale or Lease of Land/Closing of Fair St Ext	December 2018
b. City, Town or Village ZiYoo N Planning Board or Commission	Site Plan and Special Use Permit	December 2018
c. City Council, Town or ZYes No Village Zoning Board of Appeals 	Area variance(s)-possible, not definite	December 2018
d. Other local agencies ☑Yes□Ne	Historic Landmarks Commission, City of Kingston Public Works, Water Dept	December 2018
e. County agencies		December 2018
f. Regional agencies ☐Yes☐No	butter Startly Flaming Board	
g. State agencies ☑Yes□No	Funding of portions of project(Empire St. Dev) NYSDEC SPDES General Permit for Stormwater	January 2019
h. Federal agencies	Superal Permet for Stormwater	

https://bit.ly/3GscRnz

At no time throughout this mendacious process would the Kingston Local Development Corporation be named to negotiate the sale of North Front Street or that Fair Street Extension would require an easement and be partially abandoned.

The applicant misled the public and our representatives in this instance from the start. When there are significant changes like these, they must be required to amend their EAF in order for there to be a complete and thorough environmental review to determine the mitigation of the significant adverse environmental impacts, and that includes traffic.

Furthermore, the council missed an important opportunity to assert itself into the process to ask questions as an involved agency in order to gain clarity and certainty that all of the appropriate studies were done as it pertained to closing Fair Street Extension. In all of the years of my following the Kingstonian project, not once did a member of the council publically engage in the environmental review process.

The planning board's negative declaration is now a noose around your neck, as you are beholden to their decision that includes all of the inadequate traffic studies that they approved without your input.

What's worse, is that the KLDC and the easement/abandonment of Fair Street Extension wasn't on anyone's radar because it was a tactic that was devised following the environmental review in order to keep a wealthy stakeholder from purchasing either or both the land and the street. Otherwise, had the process proceeded as expected based on the city

charter, the land and the street would have been required to go out to the highest bidder.

The executive branch of city hall can spin it anyway they'd like in order to use you to achieve its goals. But there is a record of these flaws, and whether or not they are upheld in a court of law, they will forever be associated with your name as a part of this city's reckless history.

The planning boards' negative declaration and the council's decision to approve an easement for Fair Street Extension makes the direction of your vote clear to me. But I also know that there are members of the council who have real concerns about what's taken place but not the courage to call it out.

Therefore, my request to our council is that for those who vote yes who have concerns of deceit - and that includes our council president who hides behind not having to vote - if you harbor any regret, then place that on the record when you vote to repair the public's trust that has been deeply harmed through this project process and perhaps, too, to repair your own conscience.

Rebecca Martin Kingston, NY

20 year Kingston resident and member of KingstonCitizens.org

From:

Anne Craig <apybcraig@gmail.com>

Sent:

Friday, January 14, 2022 8:01 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] Fair Street Extension abandonment

To whom it shall concern,

I oppose the abandonment of the Fair Street Extension Sincerely,

Anne Pyburn Craig

From:

Rebecca Martin < rebbytunes@gmail.com>

Sent:

Friday, January 14, 2022 12:53 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] Fair Street Extension Public Comment for the record

When the Kingstonian environmental assessment form (EAF) was submitted to the Kingston planning board in early 2019 to begin the project's environmental review process, the council was listed as having two important decisions to make pertaining to the "sale or lease of land" and "closing of Fair Street Extension".

		ax relief, and any other forms of f
Government Entity	If Yes: Identify Agency and Approval(s) Required	Application Date (Actual or projected)
a. City Council, Town Board, ✓ Yes No or Village Board of Trustees	Sale or Lease of Land/Closing of Fair St Ext	December 2018
b. City, Town or Village Vyco No Planning Board or Commission	Site Plan and Special Use Permit	December 2018
c. City Council, Town or ✓Yes□No Village Zoning Board of Appeals	Area variance(s)-possible, not definite	December 2018
d. Other local agencies ☑Yes□No	Historic Landmarks Commission, City of Kingston Public Works, Water Dept	December 2018
e. County agencies ☑Yes□No	Ulster County IDA Ulster County Planning Board	December 2018
f. Regional agencies ☐Yes☐No	- Saniting Board	
g. State agencies	Funding of portions of project(Empire St. Dev) NYSDEC SPDES General Permit for Stormwater	January 2019
n. Federal agencies ☐Yes☐No	or Stormwater	

https://bit.ly/3GscRnz

At no time throughout this mendacious process would the Kingston Local Development Corporation be named to negotiate the sale of North Front Street or that Fair Street Extension would require an easement and be partially abandoned.

The applicant misled the public and our representatives in this instance from the start. When there are significant changes like these, they must be required to amend their EAF in order for there to be a complete and thorough environmental review to determine the mitigation of the significant adverse environmental impacts, and that includes traffic.

Furthermore, the council missed an important opportunity to assert itself into the process to ask questions as an involved agency in order to gain clarity and certainty that all of the appropriate studies were done as it pertained to closing Fair Street Extension. In all of the years of my following

the Kingstonian project, not once did a member of the council publically engage in the environmental review process.

The planning board's negative declaration is now a noose around your neck, as you are beholden to their decision that includes all of the inadequate traffic studies that they approved without your input.

What's worse, is that the KLDC and the easement/abandonment of Fair Street Extension wasn't on anyone's radar because it was a tactic that was devised following the environmental review in order to keep a wealthy stakeholder from purchasing either or both the land and the street. Otherwise, had the process proceeded as expected based on the city charter, the land and the street would have been required to go out to the highest bidder.

The executive branch of city hall can spin it anyway they'd like in order to use you to achieve its goals. But there is a record of these flaws, and whether or not they are upheld in a court of law, they will forever be associated with your name as a part of this city's reckless history.

The planning boards' negative declaration and the council's decision to approve an easement for Fair Street Extension makes the direction of your vote clear to me. But I also know that there are members of the council who have real concerns about what's taken place but not the courage to call it out.

Therefore, my request to our council is that for those who vote yes who have concerns of deceit - and that includes our council president who hides behind not having to vote - if you harbor any regret, then place that on the record when you vote to repair the public's trust that has been deeply harmed through this project process and perhaps, too, to repair your own conscience.

Rebecca Martin Kingston, NY

20 year Kingston resident and member of KingstonCitizens.org

From: Debbie Zibella <debbie@macfitness.net>

Sent: Friday, January 14, 2022 8:06 AM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] The Kingstonian

- Uplown Kingston despetately needs public parking, in order to provide a first class parking garage at NO cost to taxpavers, local business leaders came together to offer to build a public parking garage as part of a hotel/apartiment/retail project. In addition to 277 public pairling spots, the Kingstonian will also provide more lax evenue, affordable housing, public restrooms, new housing stock, over 300 new daily consumers to the uplown district, construction jobs, increased sales lax, tourism and ADA comptiant pedestrian access to the business district, in order to make this project a success, it is necessary to partially close a portion
- of Fair Street Extension. Once closed, developers will construct, for use by the general public:

 A plaza which will contain a klosk promoting historic sites in and around Kingston and the Hudson Valley.

 Storefronts inside the pedestrian plaza creating sales lax and employment.
- An ADA compiliant pedestrian bridge to link the uprown business district to Kingston Plaza and additional parking.
 The pedestrian plaza and ADA compiliant bridge are part of the DRI grant and specifically included in how the DRI funds must be used
- The bridge encourages walkability and pedestrian safety two Important items the project was specially asked to provide.
 As presented from the onset, the linking of both sides of the street is what makes the project most beneficial to the community and economically feasible to build. It allows the project to meet multiple goals cullined in advance by the City of Klingston and so much more—public parking, housing, employment, walkability, pedestrian safety, public restrooms, affordable housing, and public gathering space.

Deborah Zibella

Office Manager **MAC Fitness** 338 Plaza Rd. Kingston, NY 12401 P: 845-853-7377

C: 845-750-7133

macfitness.net ×

From:

info@churchdesartistes.com < peter.wetzler@gmail.com>

Sent:

Friday, January 14, 2022 8:34 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] Fair Street Extension Abandonment

To Whom it May Concern:

We write in fervent opposition to the abandonment of the the Fair Street Extension and in protest to the misinformation aided and abetted by press coverage over the facts. Because of the "super spreader event" @ George Washington School that prevented many of the people opposed to the Fair Street Extension from attending and was attended by many many partisan (wearing Herzog jackets) friends and or employees of Brad Jordan the "meeting" to discuss the issue was skewed and misrepresented.

Please have the courage to stand up against the strong-arming of our elected officials and stand for the equitable development that will occur in Uptown without insider favoritism and corruption.

Thank you,

Julie Hedrick and Peter Wetzler

Residents

From:

Tom Hoffay <thoffay160@gmail.com>

Sent:

Friday, January 14, 2022 8:56 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Subject:

Re: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Document shared with you: "Fair St. Public Hearing."

Ugh...

Can you clip it from my facebook account?

My statement - to be included in tonight's Public Hearing on the Kingstonian's request for a partial closure of Fair St. Extension (1 block).

January 12,2022

Dear President Shaut and members of the Common Council,

Good evening. As a senior citizen in the Kingston community, in light of the Covid pandemic, although I was looking forward to attending tonight's Public Hearing on the Kingstonian application for the partial closing of Fair St., I chose to submit a written statement instead for your consideration.

I am a strong supporter of the Kingstonian Project for the Uptown, Stockade District in our city. I represented the district, part of the Second Ward, for three terms on the Common Council. I have served on the Board of KUBA (Kingston Uptown Business Association) and the Friends of Historic Kingston. I mention these only to establish that I am familiar with the very unique history, circumstances and controversies of the area, now the subject of great scrutiny.

I was Alderman for the Second Ward when the parking garage was demolished after it was found to have structural issues, speaking of controversies - and when the city adopted the NYS DOT plan for the recently completed roundabout. The Pike Plan renovations, inherited from my predecessor, are worthy of a book! To sustain the new vitality of what is admittedly a rather compressed area, it is necessary to embrace infrastructure challenges, not dismiss them out of hand. Kingston has an opportunity to make a sustained improvement to the quality of living, working and visiting this historic gem. The KIngstonian project is a defining moment for the city - will it move forward or risk stagnation? Rejecting components of the plan such as the Fair St. extension modification, might very well end that opportunity. It would certainly discourage any attempts at future development and leave a gaping hole in the streetscape.

An additional comment is warranted concerning the recent attack on the integrity of the Kingston Fire Department. While on the Common Council I served as liaison to the Fire Commission, and presently serve as one of the Commissioners. Like many other residents of this city I was stunned to see full page ads in the Daily Freeman and on social media declaring that fire protection would suffer if the Fair St extension were to close. No attempt was made by the author of this scurrilous attack to contact the department, the only consultant was a paid hack of William Gottlieb Real Estate.

The Kingston Fire Department is highly regarded in New York State, providing emergency medical as well as fire service. Buildings are subject to inspection and new buildings are offered design consultation. To imply that KFD would somehow endanger the health and safety of residents - as a way to attack the Kingstonian project - is truly contemptible. No contact was made with the Chief of the Department, no input was requested before this tactic by opponents was used. How egregious it is to compromise the work of the men and women who serve as emergency responders under such hazardous circumstances. With the Frog Alley Station just one long block away from Fair St. Extension, the accusation in the full paid ad is false and intended to prey upon concerns of the community.

Enough has been said about the Kingstonian Project - it has passed through many reviews and survived lawsuits by the representatives of the same real estate organization. It's time to let the project proceed to completion. Please support the legislation for the closing of Fair St. extension.

Respectfully. Tom Hoffay

On Fri, Jan 14, 2022 at 8:19 AM Tinti, Elisa < emtinti@kingston-ny.gov > wrote:

I did not.

Elisa Tinti

City Clerk and Registrar

City of Kingston

(845) 334-3914 Office

(845) 334-3918 Fax

Kingston City Clerk Webpage



From: Tom Hoffay [mailto:thoffay160@gmail.com]

Sent: Thursday, January 13, 2022 2:09 PM To: Tinti, Elisa <emtinti@kingston-ny.gov>

Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Document shared with you: "Fair St. Public Hearing."

Thank you for the heads up. Did you get my new email?

On Thu, Jan 13, 2022 at 12:05 PM Tinti, Elisa < emtinti@kingston-ny.gov > wrote:

Hi Tom,

This document is blank. Please resend.

Jennifer O'Donnell Testimony - Fair Street Extension

I am Gloria Waslyn. This is testimony by Jennifer O'Donnell, Kingston resident and urban planning professional.

The Fair Street Extension is a key part of the vision for Uptown Kingston in the I-587 Intersection plan. The Ulster County Transportation Council made this plan in a highly participatory process in 2011, Kingston's Mayor serves on that council. In 2014, the Common Council voted to fund and implement it, It was also part of the DRI Uptown application proposal.

What was that vision? It extended uptown through Kingston Plaza and connected I-587 into the plaza. When I-587 was built during Urban Renewal, it effectively bypassed Uptown, destroying its economic vitality. Access and circulation are the keys to a successful business district. The <u>current</u> I-587 plan reverses that damage and provides an opportunity to create numerous building parcels, building frontage, and commercial activity. When plans like this are adopted, federal and state funds are available.

Well-planned development parcels, affordable housing, walkability, parks, and trails are critical for uptown's economic future. The I-587 plan was based on the proven success of form-based code that is successfully reshaping neighborhoods across America -- not just one site for one private development!

The recent rezoning process was so well done <u>and inclusive</u>. Dover Kohl, the planners who worked with us, were very clear when they said: "*Never give up your streets!*"

To abandon a street in Kingston, the city's code <u>requires</u> that the city planner justify the abandonment of a street with a detailed report and data showing that the street is not useful. This was never done. We should make all our decisions informed with facts. We should honor the commitments we make to the public. We should respect the laws that exist to protect us all.

There is no justification to renege on an effort that was funded by taxpayers. By doing this, you are telling the public not to trust your plans and that their participation doesn't matter.

The public needs to trust that elected officials will pursue the plans they make in good faith. Don't further the mistakes we made during Urban Renewal.

Please vote NO to closing the Fair Street Extension.

Thank you.

		=

Mail body: Fwd: Updated version of testimony

----- Forwarded message -----

From Jennifer O'Donnell < jenniferodonnell 2018@gmail.com>

Date: Wed, Jan 12, 2022, 1:16 PM Subject: Updated version of testimony To: <gloriawaslyn@gmail.com>

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1_Me8KxqtymhyrLUi_hzW6L5Gnp85OKaCV4KeZn8MgHc/edit

Jennifer O'Donnell

Mobile: 845.389.2404

Principal and Founder HONE STRATEGIC LLC

A Woman-Owned Business Enterprise (WBE) Urban Planning & Historic Preservation

Development Advising/Project Management

www.HoneStrategic.com

Co-Owner and COO Stone Dock Golf Course

12 Stone Dock Road High Falls, NY 12440 Pro Shop: 845.687,7107

stonedockgolfcourse.com Like and follow us on Facebook

From: Marcia Roosa < blondecowgirl11@gmail.com>

Sent: Friday, January 14, 2022 9:27 AM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Cc: Noble, Steve; info@kingstonianny.net

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] I Support the Partial Road Closure of Fair Street Extension

City of Kingston Common Council c/o Elisa Tinti, City Clerk 420 Broadway Kingston, NY 12401

Email: emtinti@kingston-ny.gov

Phone: (845) 334-3915

Dear Kingston Common Council Member,

I am writing in favor of the Council voting to partially close Fair Street Extension. I believe the multitude of public benefits the Kingstonian project brings speaks for itself and clearly warrants this decision.

I thank you for your continued support of this vital economic initiative.

Thank you for your service,

<< BE SURE TO ENTER YOUR FULL NAME HERE >> Marcia Roosa

From:

John Marino <jmarino8@outlook.com>

Sent:

Friday, January 14, 2022 9:30 AM

To:

Tinti, Elisa

Cc:

Noble, Steve; info@kingstonianny.net

Subject:

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] I Support the Partial Road Closure of Fair Street Extension

City of Kingston Common Council c/o Elisa Tinti, City Clerk 420 Broadway Kingston, NY 12401 Email: emtinti@kingston-ny.gov

Phone: (845) 334-3915

Dear Kingston Common Council Member,

I am writing in favor of the Council voting to partially close Fair Street Extension. I believe the multitude of public benefits the Kingstonian project brings speaks for itself and clearly warrants this decision.

I thank you for your continued support of this vital economic initiative.

Thank you for your service, John J. Marino

Sent from my iPad John J. Marino

From: Linda Marino < lindamarino 2@icloud.com>

Sent: Friday, January 14, 2022 10:54 AM

To: Tinti, Elisa

Cc: Noble, Steve; info@kingstonianny.net

Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] I Support the Partial Road Closure of Fair Street Extension

City of Kingston Common Council
 c/o Elisa Tinti, City Clerk
 420 Broadway
 Kingston, NY 12401
 Email: emtinti@kingston-ny.gov
 Phone: (845) 334-3915
 Dear Kingston Common Council Member,

 I am writing in favor of the Council voting to partially close Fair Street Extension. I believe the multitude of public benefits the Kingstonian project brings speaks for itself and clearly warrants this decision.

 I thank you for your continued support of this vital economic initiative.

 Thank you for your service,

 <B SURE TO ENTER YOUR FULL NAME HERE >> Linda M Marino

Sent from my iPhone