

# CITY OF KINGSTON

planning@kingston-ny.gov



Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director

Steven T. Noble, Mayor

---

## HISTORIC LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

### MEETING MINUTES

May 13<sup>th</sup>, 2024  
(Rescheduled from May 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2024)

In-Person – Conference Room I, City Hall, 6:30 PM

#### HLPC COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Mark Grunblatt, Chairman  
Kevin McEvoy  
Andrea Puetz, Architect  
Robert Tonner, ABSENT  
Nettie Morano  
Vacant  
Vacant

#### CITY STAFF & OFFICIALS:

Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director  
Ethan Dickerman, Hist. Pres. Admin.

#### GENERAL BUSINESS:

**NOTE 1:** There were no written comments received.

**NOTE 2:** Due to the recording and capability of using such to be transcribed, all votes were roll call votes.

**NOTE 3:** LINK to HLPC Applications & Materials <https://kingston-ny.gov/content/8399/8491/8499/35761/default.aspx>

#### CALL MEETING TO ORDER:

1. Adoption of HLPC Minutes of April 4<sup>th</sup>, 2024, Meeting: [https://www.kingston-ny.gov/filestorage/8399/10476/16128/16481/63965/2024.4.4\\_hlpc\\_minutes.pdf](https://www.kingston-ny.gov/filestorage/8399/10476/16128/16481/63965/2024.4.4_hlpc_minutes.pdf)

**DECISION:** Chair Grunblatt asked members present if they had read and reviewed the minutes of April 4<sup>th</sup>, 2024. No discussion or comment returned. The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the minutes from the April 4<sup>th</sup>, 2024, meeting as presented: (AP-motion, NM-2nd, MG, KM - yes).

#### NEW BUSINESS:

2. **#601 Broadway (UPAC):** Replacement of 2<sup>nd</sup> floor street-facing wood windows. SBL: 56.109-3-19. SEQR Type II. Transect Zone: T5MS, HA, Local Landmark. Ward 4. BARDAVON 1869 OPERA HOUSE, Inc, applicant/owner.

**DISCUSSION:** Chris Silva, Executive Director of the BARDAVON 1869 OPERA HOUSE, Inc, and Betsy Garthwaite, Facilities Manager, presented plans for replacing the existing 2<sup>nd</sup>-story Broadway facing wood windows at 601 Broadway (UPAC) a local landmark. C. Silva informed the Commission that the existing windows are in severe disrepair and prevent the 2<sup>nd</sup>-story interior space from being used due to their ineffective R-value. UPAC planned to replace these windows for years and finally received grant funding for the project. Prior to undertaking the work, UPAC submitted existing conditions photographs to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for review who determined that their removal would not adversely impact the structure's integrity and that the proposed LePage Millwork (Canadian Based manufacturer) replicas are appropriate for the structure. Staff questioned if any windows could be saved, or portions salvaged to combine and restore some of the windows. C. Silva explained that the age of the windows are unknown and that they are so severely degraded that they are most likely to fall apart.

# CITY OF KINGSTON

planning@kingston-ny.gov



Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director

Steven T. Noble, Mayor

**DECISION:** The Commission voted unanimously in favor of rendering the action a Type II under SEQR and recommended that the proposed replacement of all 2nd-story Broadway facing wood windows at 601 Broadway, a local landmark, by the owner, BARDAVON 1869 OPERA HOUSE Inc. ("UPAC"), if done according to the plans reviewed at this meeting and according to the procedures stipulated in Section 405-26 L, of the City of Kingston's Form Based Zoning Code, is compatible with the historic character of the landmark for the following reasons:

- that the proposed work is to take place at the two-story Colonial Revival theater/commercial building situated near the corner of Broadway and Cedar Street, that according to the July 2003 Building Structure inventory Form prepared by David L. Taylor, was "erected as a movie house in 1927 by the Kingston Theater Corporation - [and known] by the '1930s as the Broadway Theater. - The structure's design is the result of the collaboration of local architect George E. Lowe (1890-1966) and Bridgeport, Connecticut theater specialist Douglas B. Hall (d. 1945)."
- that the existing 2nd-story Broadway facing wood windows are severely degraded beyond restoration capability and require immediate treatment this year;
- that the 601 Broadway is subject to two preservation covenants that require the property owner to seek New York State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) review prior to the undertaking of any visual and/or material changes that could adversely impact the structure's integrity;
- that UPAC submitted photographs of the existing windows conditions along with a request for permission to replace said windows with custom made, LePage Millwork, single hung, wood and aluminum clad windows made to match the design, operation, and color of the existing windows;
- that on December 14th, 2023, SHPO Historic Site Restoration Coordinator Sara McIvor determined that the proposed project "will have NO ADVERSE IMPACT on historic and archaeological resources";
- that after reviewing the proposed project and supporting materials, the HLPC shall follow the NO ADVERSE IMPACT position taken by SHPO and permit the replacement of the existing windows with the proposed LePage Millwork windows;
- that all wood windows approved for replacement must be transferred to an architectural salvage supply center or to a professional historic preservationist, for future re-use, and that the applicant shall provide a record of transfer as documentation to the Historic Landmarks Preservation Commission;
- that any changes or additions to the plans and/or work specifically described and outlined in the submitted application will be subject to further review by our commission prior to the work being carried out;
- that the Commission's approval does not obviate the need for a Building Permit from the City of Kingston's Building Safety Division or any other required approvals from relevant coordinating agencies;

Based on the preceding findings of fact, it is proposed to move that on the 13th day of May 2024, the Commission grant a Preservation Notice of Action to the above referenced Applicant, for the work as described herein and in its application to the Commission, such notice to be subject to the conditions contained in the foregoing motion.

(MG - Motion, NM - 2nd, AP - yes, KM - yes)

3. **#129 Maiden Lane:** Converting existing ground floor window to entryway door & adding lighting. SBL: 56.91-2-25.200. SEQR Type II. Transect Zone: T4N-O, HA, Local Landmark. Ward: 2. Dorothy Pierson, applicant; Aditi Goswami, owner.

**DISCUSSION:** The applicant, Dorothy Pierson, RA, presented plans to modify an existing ground floor window along Green Street into a new street-facing entryway for a 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor guest apartment. D. Pierson explained that the window is not original to the structure and made from glass blocks. The window is situated in a 19<sup>th</sup>-century timber framed addition to the original stone dwelling. D. Pierson also explained that the door will be a simple 1/1 panel wood door, with no exterior storm door added. New steps will be made of bluestone and comply with the city code. D.

# CITY OF KINGSTON

planning@kingston-ny.gov



Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director

Steven T. Noble, Mayor

Pierson, informed staff that the hardware shall be an Antique Hardware Supply (TM) Solid Brass Rectangular Full Length Morise Entryway Set D. Pierson, RA, also proposes to install a 14-watt (100-Watt equivalent) LED Feiss Lighting-Redding Station-small outdoor wall lantern (9" wide by 9.69" tall by 10.38" extension) in Bronze finishes. A. Puetz, Commission Architect, noted that the side lamp height appears to be low in the drawings and will require placement up higher for adequacy and code.

**DECISION:** The Commission voted unanimously in favor of rendering the action a Type II under SEQR and recommended that the proposed conversion of an existing window to an entryway door at 129 Maiden Lane, a local landmark, by Aditi Goswami, if done according to the plans reviewed at this meeting and according to the procedures stipulated in Section 405-26 L, of the City of Kingston's Form Based Zoning Code, is compatible with the historic character of the district for the following reasons:

- that the proposed work is to take place at the five-bay, double pile, 2 and 112 story vernacular dwelling at the northeast corner of Maiden Lane and Green Street in the which "was built circa mid-18th-century by the McLean family and burnt in October of 1777 by the British, and which was modified to suit the changing needs of the McLeans and subsequent owners (the Schoonmaker and Fowlers) over the next 200+ years" (Marvelli,2023);
- that the new owner, Aditi Goswami, seeks to convert an existing window on the timber addition along Green Street into a new entryway door leading lo a 2nd floor staircase;
- that the proposed window is comprised of fixed glass blocks and not original to the structure;
- that the proposed door shall be the same width as the existing window's opening and made of solid wood with 1/1 panels consistent with that of the structure's primary entrance along Maiden Lane;
- that the hardware shall be an Antique Hanivare Supply (TM) Solid Brass Rectangular Full Length Morise Entryway Set;
- that the applicant shall install blue stone steps leading from the sidewalk to the proposed door that meet Building Code;
- that the applicant shall install a single Feiss Lighting-Redding Station small outdoor wall lantern lamp in bronze color on the door's eastward side;
- that the Commission reviewed the proposed project's supporting materials and determined it conforms with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the character of the individual Landmark - because it could be undone, with a fair degree of ease, at a future time, if so desired by the owners;
- that any changes or additions to the plans and/or work specifically described and outlined in the submitted application will be subject to further review by our commission prior to the work being carried out;
- that the Commission's approval does not obviate the need for a Building Permit from the City of Kingston's Building Safety Division or any other required approvals from relevant coordinating agencies;

Based on the preceding findings of fact, it is proposed to move that on the 13th day of May 2024, the Commission grant a Preservation Notice of Action to the above referenced Applicant, for the work as described herein and in the application to the Commission, such notice to be subject to the conditions contained in the foregoing motion. (MG-Motion, NM-2<sup>nd</sup>, KM-yes, AP – yes).

4. **#48 (46) N. Front Street:** Modifications to fenestration and adding a cornice. SBL: 48.331-1-4.100. SEQR Type II. Transect Zone: T5MS, HA, KSHD. Ward: 2. Paul B. Jankovitz, RA, applicant; 44 North Front Street, LLC., owner.

**DISCUSSION:** The applicant, Paul B. Jankovitz, presented plans to modify the 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor fenestration at 48 (46/44) N. Front Street. P. Jankovitz proposed Pella Double Hung – clad, architect series reserve with black frames and grills. Each window will be 3'.1" x 4'.11" to meet egress requirements. No window trim is identified. The new order and

# CITY OF KINGSTON

planning@kingston-ny.gov



Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director

Steven T. Noble, Mayor

height of the fenestration is drawn from the adjacent property that houses Stella's. P. Jankovitz also informed staff that the new cornice element will project 18" beyond the structure's face and no color has been selected at this time. P. Jankovitz informed Staff that the Everywhere Shop will resubmit an application for modified signage given the proposed window's impacts. Staff questioned P. Jankovitz on the proposed modifications, the 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor interior apartment space, the roof, and code compliance. The Commission felt that 1/1 windows (without a 3 lite transom) ordered similarly to the adjacent Stella's building are more appropriate. The Commission also questioned the proposed cornice's color and Form Based Code Compliance under sections: Section 405.14 C.2. e., Section 405.14 E.2., and Section 405.14 G.1. Other architectural elements are with the exterior stucco treatment finish.

**DECISION:** The Commission voted unanimously to TABLE the proposed project pending the applicant's return to the commission with an updated rendering that demonstrates compliance with the City of Kingston's Form Based Code based on feedback received from the Commission. The applicant was advised that where compliance cannot be met, there may be waivers and/or variances required. (NM-motion, KM-2<sup>nd</sup>, MG, AP-yes).

## RECOMMENDATIONS:

5. **#85 (83) Broadway (Half Moon Rondout Café):** Non-code conforming window signage, minor waiver request. SBL: 56.43-4-38.150. SEQR Type II. Transect Zone: T5MS, CZ, HA, RWSHD. Ward: 8. Kaira Grundig, applicant; MIDDLE SEAT LLC, owner.

**DISCUSSION:** K. Grundig was present to discuss the window signage request. Per the City's Form Based Code, non-conforming window signage within historic districts must be reviewed by the HLPC. The Planning Administrator has received a request for window signage from Kaira Grundig, of Half Moon Rondout Café. The matter was referred to the HLPC for a recommendation on a minor waiver of Section 405.17.E: Pedestrian Oriented Signs which limits window signage to 1 per shopfront. K. Grundig seeks a waiver to install two window signs at their 85 (83) Broadway location in the Rondout-West Strand Historic District. Both signs shall be 48" wide by 28.93" tall. A single door window sign 12" wide by 9.45" tall will also be installed. Colors will be white and gold. The Commission recognized that the large windows were more balanced with signage in each, and that transparency of the design is not inhibited. Overall, the intent of the Code is not diminished.

**DECISION:** The Commission reviewed the proposed signage and determined it visually compatible with the character of the RWSHD. (MG-motion, AP-2<sup>nd</sup>, KM, NM-yes).

6. **#311 Wall Street:** Non-code conforming wall signage, minor waiver request. SBL: 48.331-1-16. SEQR Type II. Transect Zone: T5MS, HA, KSHD. Ward 2. Paul B. Jankovitz, RA, applicant; 311 Wall Street, LLC., owner.

**DISCUSSION:** P. Jankovitz was present to discuss the wall signage request. Per the City's Form Based Code, non-conforming wall signage within historic districts must be reviewed by the HLPC. The Planning Administrator received a request for wall mounted lettering from Paul B. Jankovitz, RA. The matter was referred to the HLPC for a recommendation on a waiver of Section 405.17.E: Pedestrian Oriented Signs for the installation of a new wall sign that exceeds the max size limit at 311 Wall Street. 311 Wall Street now houses Uptown Studios. Historically, F.W. Woolworth Company occupied the structure, and the historic signage serves as the inspiration for the proposed Uptown Studios signage. The proposed Uptown Studios sign will be backlit with a "halo" effect. The City's FBC permits Wall signs up to 60 square feet, and the proposed sign's lettering is 180 square feet of the structure's Wall Street façade. Typical frontage in for store in this area is 20 feet wide. The Commission also recognized that the signage was approved under a previous code review.

# CITY OF KINGSTON

planning@kingston-ny.gov



Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director

Steven T. Noble, Mayor

---

**DECISION:** The Commission reviewed the proposed historically informed signage and determined that it is compatible with the character of the Kingston Stockade Historic District. (MG-motion, NM-2<sup>nd</sup>, KM, AP-yes).

## **DISCUSSION:**

### **7. Form Based Code Review: Section 405.26.L: Historic Landmarks Preservation Commission**

**DISCUSSION:** Staff recommended that the Commission hold a **Special Meeting** at either the end of May or in June to carefully review the proposed edits to Section 405.26.L (HLPC) of the City's Form Based Zoning Code. Careful review of the proposed edits was deemed not possible during regular meetings and warrants the added time and attention given the proposed edits long-term influences on the Commission and Zoning Code. Staff will send out a Doodle Poll to the Commissioners to identify a suitable date and time for the meeting.

### **8. Local Landmarking FAQs Revisited** HLPC review of updated draft to be made available for public use.

**DISCUSSION:** Staff presented the final draft of a two page "Local Landmarking FAQs" document to the Commission. The Commission reviewed and issued its support for the document which will be distributed as needed and posted on the HLPC webpage.

### **9. 2024 Certified Local Government Grant Application.**

**DISCUSSION:** Staff informed the Commission that the 2024 Certified Local Government Grant Application Cycle opened and will close on May 31<sup>st</sup>, 2024. Staff plans to apply for the grant to fund nominating the proposed Wilbur Historic District to the State and National Registers of Historic Places. Staff recommends this move because of the existing support for local landmark districting and recognizes that by securing SR and NR designation property owners will be able to benefit from robust tax credit programs. Staff presented a draft letter of and requested the Commission authorize the Chairman to submit on the HLPC's behalf in support of the application.

**DECISION:** The Commission voted unanimously to support the City of Kingston's application for the 2024 Certified Local Government Grant program and for the Commission Chair to sign and send the proposed letter of support as presented. (MG-motion, KM-2<sup>nd</sup>, NM -yes, AP-yes).

**Adjourn HLPC Meeting:** 7:59 pm (MG – motion, AP – 2<sup>nd</sup>, NM and KM – yes).

**Next Meeting:** June 6<sup>th</sup>, 2024.

This meeting will be live-streamed at the City of Kingston YouTube channel:

<https://www.youtube.com/c/CityofKingstonNY>